## Acknowledgements

I would firstly like to thank my thesis supervisor Professor Annjo Klungervik Greenall of the Department of Language and Literature at NTNU. She steered me in the right direction whenever I needed it, and at the same time allowed me to find my own path in the research and writing process. Writing this thesis would not have been the same without her constant help and motivation. I would also like express my deepest gratitude towards my five informants. They offered me invaluable insight into their lives and their work. Finally, I must express my very profound gratitude to my family, friends and fellow students. They have provided me with encouragement and support throughout my studies, and last but not least through the process of writing this master's thesis. They reminded me of the importance of the studies, but also that one must enjoy life outside the university's walls. For this, I am forever grateful.

# **Table of contents**

4 Analysis and discussion	
4.1 The subtitler	
4.1.1 The informants	
4.1.2 The subtitlers' working day and perceptions of their working situation	
4.2 Conditions before and now	
4.2.1 Working conditions in the past	
4.2.2 Working conditions today	
4.2.2.1 NRK versus private sector	
4.2.2.2 The relationship between worker and employer	
4.2.2.3 Salary and fees	
4.2.2.4 Time pressure	
4.2.3 Technical tools' influence on the subtitler's work day	
4.3 Norwegian and English – the linguistic context	
4.3.1 Translating from English	
4.3.2 Opinions on Norwegians' language skills before and now	
4.3.4 The role of English in Norway	
4.3.5 The future of Norwegian subtitling	
4.4 Discussion	
4.4.1 The development of subtitlers' working conditions	
4.4.2 The use of English in Norway	
4.4.3 Subtitling as vulnerable translation	
4.4.4 The future of Norwegian subtitling	
5 Conclusion	
Literature	
Appendix A: interview guide	
Appendix B: the study's relevance to the teaching profession	

## **1** Introduction

#### 1.1 Background

In today's globalized world, an increasing part of people's everyday life is influenced by screen technology. Computers, smart phones and tablets dominate our daily routines, both at work and at home. Children are from a very young age using screen devices. Newspapers are increasingly being replaced by online newspapers. Users of online streaming services such as Netflix and HBO are a growing group. The majority of homes have one or more TVs. The Western world has become more and more dependent on screen technology, which results in a growing need for audiovisual translation.

Globalization involves rapid export of news, films and TV-series, and to ensure global revenues this material has to be translated into various target languages. In Europe, some countries have chosen dubbing while others have chosen subtitling as their preferred way of presenting foreign audiovisual material. Broadcasting would be in vain if viewers were unable to understand the material, hence subtitles are crucial. Countries with a tradition for subtitling are therefore dependent on people who possess the ability to produce target language subtitles. The subtitlers need both linguistic and technological skills to ensure that their finished products can emerge at the bottom of the smart phone-, tablet- and TV-screens.

Subtitlers have become a large and important work force. The majority of subtitlers' work is from English into other languages, as English is a lingua franca. English has become a global language, and is naturally a language in which many subtitlers work with on a daily basis. There is very little previous research on subtitlers as a group, and theory and studies on subtitlers' working conditions and language use, including premises laid on their work by the role and status of the languages they work with, are scarce. Research and theory on subtitling often focuses solely on the process of subtitling, and not on the subtitlers behind them and how they potentially influence their own textual products in terms of language influence. There is however some research on translators in general, and this has been used in this thesis, presented in section 2.3.

#### 1.2 Research focus

In this thesis, I explore how Norwegian subtitlers perceive their own working situation, whether their work situation has changed over the years and especially how they think the

English language's role in Norway may have influenced their subtitles then and now. The study aims at shedding light on the people behind the subtitles, as subtitlers are often regarded invisible translators, who get little or no attention in the language debate or in society in general. According to Venuti, translators are underpaid, critically unrecognized and largely invisible (2002, p.88). The study aims among other things at providing insight into how Norwegian subtitlers perceive the task of translating audiovisual material from English to Norwegian. The research question this thesis aims to answer is "How do Norwegian subtitlers perceive their own working situation before and now, and what are their thoughts, more specifically, on past and current English influence on Norwegian subtitles, society and citizens?"

#### 1.3 The study

The project is a study within the field of translation studies. To achieve insight in subtitlers' opinions on working conditions and knowledge towards English's role in Norway and how this influences their work as subtitlers, I interviewed a small selection of five subtitlers.

One of the subtitlers was an acquaintance from my network that I contacted during the summer of 2015. I found the other four informants through actively approaching a subtitler presented to me by an acquaintance in NRK. The subtitler suggested to post a note on a web page for translators called NAViO,<sup>1</sup> presenting my master's project and that I was searching for subtitlers translating from English to Norwegian. Ten subtitlers contacted me in the following weeks, and I decided to interview the first three that contacted me, already having collected two informants. The five informants I chose were all educated in language and/or translation studies, and had worked as subtitlers from 10 to 20 years. My initial expectations regarding the information I could get from them, was to hopefully achieve an understanding of why such a large amount of subtitles on Norwegian television today are of poor quality with several linguistic errors. This was the idea that led me to wanting to study subtitlers and subtitling. Why are subtitles today so poor? Why do not people demand higher quality in subtitling? Is this a modern phenomenon or has it developed over time? Is subtitling different from English than from other languages? These were some of my initial questions. In a general sense I wondered why subtitling in Norway today is as it is, and aimed to find this information in my master's thesis research.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> NAViO - Norsk Audiovisuell Oversetterforening.

As will be shown, the material contains important and interesting information on how subtitlers, as role models in language with great influence on the viewers, view their own working situation and how they think the role of English has developed in Norwegian society, and thereby subtitling. Many aspects appeared, in which creates an understanding of how the historical development of subtitlers' working conditions has influenced language in subtitles, and thereby influenced Norwegian viewers of foreign audiovisual material. One the whole, the subtitlers expressed a future wish for subtitling to get more attention and awareness.

#### **1.4 Section outline**

Section 2 sets the theoretical framework for the thesis, with theory on audiovisual translation before and now, subtitling, translation tools, the subtitler profession, the role of English in Europe and Norway, subtitling on Norwegian television and lastly the possible future of subtitling. Section 3 gives an account of the methods used in the study, including a discussion of quality criteria, such as validity and reliability. Section 4 consists of the analysis and discussion. The analysis presents interesting quotes and paraphrases from the subtitlers, sorted by the sequence of the interview questions. The discussion follows the analysis in section 4.4, presenting the four main findings of the research, comparing them to previous research and theories presented in section 2. Section 5 concludes the study and resumes the research question presented in the introduction, and aims to place the study in current research and present proposals for future research.

## **2** Theories

## 2.1 Audiovisual translation

Aline Remael (2010) proposes that in brief outline, audiovisual translation came into being because of the film industry (p.12). When the motion picture era begun films were first thought of as a new art, where the images created their own international language. The art of cinema changed with the arrival of sound, and because of this the distribution companies needed translation to ensure their global revenues. The film industry revolutionized when the first sound films were published during the 1920s. The earliest form of audiovisual translation (AVT) was the translation of intertitles<sup>2</sup> in silent films, and the need for AVT increased throughout the 1920s when technology made it possible to add sound to films (Ibid). "AVT is definitely here to stay and will, even by any other name, remain an interesting field for exploration" (Remael, 2010, p.16).

The most commonly used modes of audiovisual translation are subtitling, dubbing and voice-over, Remael (2010) continues (p.12) Díaz-Cintas (2003) states that in Europe, large countries such as France, Spain, Germany and Italy have traditions of dubbing international audiovisual products, while smaller countries such as Greece, Portugal, The Netherlands and the Scandinavian countries have had a preference for subtitles. Countries that have tended to prefer dubbing often have high levels of illiteracy, while countries with low economy have chosen subtitling because it is less expensive than dubbing (p.196). Gambier (2013) concurs, stating that the choice between the two forms was determined by economic, ideological and pragmatic factors, but the process was not necessarily rapidly and permanently. The modes for audiovisual translations are not set in stone, and the audiovisual market changes as technology develops (p.46).

According to Díaz-Cintas (2003) translation carried out in the audiovisual field today accounts for an increasingly large proportion of translation activity (p.193). There are two reasons for this. Firstly, audiovisual products easily reach a large number of recipients, through screen technology, such as television and computers. Secondly, large parts of the translated material is exported to other cultures and other languages across the globe, for instance translated interviews, documentaries, films, news and TV-shows, especially evident in countries where English is not the official language. Most European countries import audiovisual products from outside Europe, predominantly from the US (Díaz-Cintas, 2003,

 $<sup>\</sup>frac{1}{2}$  Intertitles - pieces of text placed on the middle of the screen, commonly used in silent films.

p.193). Díaz-Cintas presents a table that shows the proportion of audiovisual products imported in Europe from non-European countries. Denmark, here representing Scandinavia, imports 90 % of their audiovisual products from non-European countries (Ibid).

The main function of audiovisual translation is the same today as it was in the 1920's, allowing audiovisual material to cross linguistic borders. Díaz-Cintas (2013) states that translation and interpretation are imperative to overcome linguistic barriers, and have been practised for centuries as a means of fostering communication and dialogue across different linguistic and cultural communities (p.273). He further states that this ever-increasing reality of mass communication in virtual environments has resulted in radical changes in the way humans relate and communicate. We exchange ideas, messages and images through media every day, combining the visual and auditory, creating new routine practices for millions of people across the globe (Ibid).

Even though subtitles are a common and well-known method for translating audiovisual material today, there is still a large degree of invisibility surrounding audiovisual translation in the world of higher education. Díaz-Cintas indicates that the degree of invisibility might be the reason why this field of translation has not received much academic attention (2003, p. 201). In recent years however, subtitling has gained more and more attention, both in academia and beyond that.

## 2.2 Subtitling

Subtitling is one of the most common forms of audiovisual translation, together with dubbing and voice-over. Jorge Díaz Cintas and Aline Remael (2007) define subtitling as

a translation practice that consists of presenting a written text, generally on the lower part of the screen, that endeavours to recount the original dialogue of the speakers, as well as the discursive elements that appear in the image (letters, inserts, graffiti, inscriptions, placards, and the like) and the information that is contained on the soundtrack (songs, voices off) (p.8).

Cintas & Remael (2007) stress that "the key word for successful audiovisual translation is insight and understanding of the product and its expected function, combined with desire to learn and willingness to adapt" (p.13).

There are three main components in the subtitled programme; the spoken word, the image and the subtitles. The subtitles need to appear in synchrony with the image and dialogue. If not, the subtitles will not help the viewer, and may also be a source of irritation. The viewer of a film or a television programme is always in focus when subtitles are made,

because the viewer's ability to listen, watch and read determines if the meaning is ensured (Cintas & Remael, 2007, p.9). Subtitles play a crucial role to the viewer's understanding when the material's spoken language is different from the viewer's, and the need for audiovisual translation grows proportionally with the increasing export of audiovisual material in the market. According to Díaz-Cintas (2003) the mode that has undergone the greatest growth in AVT is subtitles, and that it will continue to grow in the foreseeable future (p.199).

Gottlieb (1998) states that subtitling is defined by 'semiotic composition'. Semiotic translation implies that the translated text must function within a specific communicative situation. Subtitles can be described as polysemiotic text, because the translator is either constrained or supported by a communicative channel; visual or auditory (p. 245). There are four different channels a subtitler has to consider; the verbal auditory channel (dialogue, background voices and lyrics), non-verbal auditory channel (music, natural sound and sound effects), verbal visual channel (superimposed titles and written signs on the screen) and the non-verbal visual channel (picture composition and flow).

Gottlieb argues that in audiovisual material using subtitles, authenticity is lost when it comes to reconstructing the polysemiotic whole, due to the balance shift from the verbal auditory channel to the verbal visual channel. That means that a subtitled film will not be able to convey the exact same meaning as the original, because the dialogue and other information that needs translation is both translated to another language and changed from verbal to visual. Gottlieb (1998) further states that it would be interesting to find out if the impression a film gives the audience changes because of the subtitles' presence, but that it is a question yet to be answered (p.245).

Today, it is reasonably to believe that subtitles affect the viewers' opinions on the TVshow or film, and that subtitles play an important role in how the material is received by its foreign audience. According to Munday (2008), subtitling can be defined as vulnerable translation (p.189). The co-existence of a source text soundtrack and target text subtitles creates a tension. Subtitles are constrained by space and time, but must also stand up to the scrutiny of the audience, who may have knowledge of the original source language. A viewer with some understanding of the source text will have expectations regarding their idea of the quality of the subtitles. This vulnerability is not as present in other types of translation, where the reader does not have easy access to the original, unless he or she is comparing for instance two novels side by side, comparing the source language and the target language. Because subtitles are vulnerable translation in countries where the audience has some knowledge of the original language it can represent additional pressure for the subtitler (Munday, 2008, p.190).

### 2.3 The subtitlers' profession

Cintas and Remael (2007) describe the subtitler as a professional. Three different professional 'roles' are parts of the subtitling process; the spotter, the translator and the adaptor. These roles are carried out in various ways, and today many subtitlers have the responsibility of all three. A subtitler has the required technical skills to time code the text and video file, the cultural and linguistic background needed to translate from source to target language, and the ability to reduce the amount of text if that is necessary (2007, p.34). A few years back it was not uncommon that several people cooperated on these tasks, but today one single subtitler normally completes the subtitles alone (Cintas & Remael, 2007, p.35).

Needless to say, technology has simplified the subtitling process both in terms of practicality, time and people involved. In 1991, Reiner Luyken stated that ideally the translation process should be carried out by one person, which would reduce the risk of mistakes and errors. Today, 25 years later, this is the norm for most subtitlers. Combining the tasks has one big advantage to the subtitlers. It makes them more versatile, which is beneficial when looking for translation projects. Cintas and Remael (2007) state that because most translators in AVT work freelance, it can be difficult to guarantee a steady source of income. Thereby, the more versatile the professionals are the more chance there is to find jobs (p.35).

There exists very little literature on subtitlers and their working conditions. The better part of literature on subtitling tends to focus on the process of subtitling, and not the subtitlers thoughts on their work, profession and language awareness. Because of this the following literature commenting on working conditions is taken from studies on translators in general, and not specifically subtitlers.

One aspect that often comes up concerning translators' self-assessment is invisibility. David Katan (2011) presents a study where nearly 1000 respondents, translators and interpreters, have taken part. Even though considering themselves professionals due to their knowledge and experience in the translation field, translators are aware that their work lack public recognition and that they suffer from a markedly lower social status (p.65). Cintas and Remael (2007) also comment on the invisibility subtitlers experience. Many TV programmes do not including the name of the subtitler, but this varies a lot from country to country and different TV channels. "This forced invisibility tends to have a negative impact on the social recognition of subtitlers which is most patent in the lack of copyright for their work" (p. 40). "In respect of the visibility of the translator, the move towards web-based MT services can appear to make invisible the labour of translation" (Cronin, 2010, p.136).

According to Remael (2010), most forms of audiovisual translation have traditionally implied collaboration between different agents in the production process and the subtitlers. "New technical and socioeconomic developments are enhancing that process, sometimes to the detriment of translators' status and working conditions, and a focus on quantity rather than quality" (Remael, 2010, p. 15).

A study by Rakefet Sela-Sheffy (2005) presents Israeli translators' question of autonomy, finding that most translators' career patterns are very loose and informal, that they often practise translating as a temporary or part-time work, that entry in this line of work often happens as a second career and that learning mostly occurs through experience and not formal education (p.10). In addition, the respondents confirmed a feeling of working in the shadows and not being noticed.

Furthermore, the respondents in Sela-Sheffy's study express that working as a translator often involves working in isolation. Some say that they fit into this line of work because they are introvert, independent and like working alone, while others say that they are stressed and lonely. "In spite of the uncertainty and pressure that come with these working conditions (irregular flow of jobs, changing clientele, impossible deadlines), many of them prefer being self-employed, running their own one-person business" (Sela-Sheffy, 2005, p.18). Cintas & Remael (2007) also points to the fact that freelancing tends to be the most common form of employment for subtitlers. Only in countries where the volume of subtitling is very high are subtitlers hired in-house (p.36).

#### 2.4 Audiovisual translation before and now

The terminology has changed a lot when talking about audiovisual translation, according to Gambier (2013). The terminology has changed concurrently with the contribution of technology and the expansion and increased practice and research on AVT, from *film translation* in publications from the 50s and 60s, *language transfer* during the 80s and 90s and then to the today most commonly used term, *audiovisual translation*. The term covers film, radio, television and DVD (p.46). This section will describe the development of audiovisual translation, focusing on machine translation and globalization.

The development that has influenced the subtitlers' working day the most is the technological. Technology on translation tools has revolutionized the process of subtitling. New translation tools have contributed to a working day in 2016 being very different from a working day in 1996. Folaron (2010) states that the adoption of personal desktop computers in

the middle of the 1980s was a turning point in the history of professional work processes in translation. In less than thirty years, technology radically transformed the content and procedures of professional translators (p.429). She says that today's accelerated work pace and expectations cannot be underestimated when assessing translators' working conditions. Globalization, economy and employment trends dictate the repertory of tools used by translators (p.430).

#### 2.4.1 Machine translation

Today, technology has brought a new participant into the competition for subtitling work, machine translation (MT). It is however important to separate machine translation and computer-aided translation. Machine translation means a computer translation without any human touch, while computer-aided translation is done by a professional who has access to various translation tools (Forcada, 2010, p. 215). There are several factors one has to think about before giving computers responsibility for translations, and a machine that can create human language is yet to be created. In David Katan's study on translators from 2011, the translators were asked where they saw competition coming from in their field of work. While two major groups were seen as the main competitors, non-specialist translation amateurs and subject specialist translation amateurs, technology was only seen as a mild threat in the middle to long term (p. 73). Despite of the development of technology in translation, it does not seem as translators consider machine translation a threat. Forcada (2010) concludes that it is quite clear that machine translation will never take the place of professional translators. When machine translation systems improve over time, it can be of great help to unburden the most mechanical work of translators, resulting in them being as productive as possible to the world's growing need for translation (p. 222).

#### 2.4.2 Globalization and translation

Globalization has resulted in a growing need for audiovisual translation. "One of the immediate consequences of the much cited phenomenon of globalisation is that the professional world of translation is increasingly homogeneous and less subject to geographical boundaries" (Díaz-Cintas, 2003, p.202). One of the dimensions to linkage in a global age is the linguistic. This implies "the attempt to bridge the distance of language difference through the agency of the translator" (Cronin, 2010, p.134). Cronin further states that the phenomenon of globalization is unthinkable without translation. An explanation of why globalization and translation are closely linked together is the matter of economy. Economy is said to be informational, because firms, regions and nations are dependent on

creating, processing and applying information. The economy is said to be global, and this because production, consumption and distribution are organized on a global scale (Cronin, 2010, p.135). Audiovisual products, such as TV-shows and films, can be exported to foreign countries and audiences, but that depends on translation.

The status of the translator itself may be changing. More and more amateur subtitlers publish their own subtitles on the Internet, often called 'fansubs' (Cintas & Remael, 2007, p.26). New online practices are a recent feature of globalization which both generates translation needs and also may change the profession of the translator; the ideas on what defines good translation and what a translator is, has changed due to the Internet (Cronin, 2010, p.136).

Cintas and Remael (2007) stress that despite of globalization and the exporting of TVprogrammes and films it often seems like producers seldom show much interest in subtitles. They say that many directors still have to wake up to the reality that the translation process is an artistic factor, where more control needs to be exerted and that it is worthwhile to invest the necessary amount of money. After all, these sums are generally very little compared to the overall budget (Cintas & Remael, 2007, p.38).

According to Díaz-Cintas (2003) subtitles is a great source for language learning. To hear the original dialogue and contrast what we are hearing with what we are reading in our own language encourages foreign language learning, particularly English. He further states that it is often assumed that in countries with a strong tradition of subtitling, people have better knowledge of English than those living in countries where dubbing is the preferred mode. "This, together with the fact that many of these languages are being 'anglicised', both on a semantic and a syntactic level, means that we are running the risk of arriving at what could be called translation zero" (Díaz-Cintas, 2003, p.202).

### **2.5 English in Europe and Norway**

Today, many subtitlers translate to their source languages from English, due to English's role as a global language and lingua franca. The role and status of the languages subtitlers choose to work with are an important part of the conditions they work under.

#### 2.5.1 English as a global language

English is today considered a global language by most people. But what is a global language? Crystal (2003) states that "a language achieves a genuinely global status when it develops a special role that is recognized in every country" (p.3). This role is most apparent in countries

where many people have English as a mother tongue. However, the use of mother tongue does not give a language global status. To achieve a global status, a language needs to be used also by other countries, and given a place within their communities. There are two different ways to do this. The first way is to make the language an official language. The second way is to make the language a priority in foreign-language teaching, whereby children from a young age learn the language in school (Crystal, 2003, p.4).

Crystal (2003) states that English has become the most widely taught foreign language in over 100 countries and are in these countries emerging as the chief foreign language encountered in schools (p.5). It is however important to have in mind that the reasons for choosing English as their favoured foreign language are many, and varies for historical, political and other reasons. Statistics show that approximately a quarter of the world's population is fluent or competent in English. Crystal (2003) states clear that translation has played a central role in communication between people for thousands of years, though often unrecognized (p.11).

#### 2.5.2 English as a lingua franca

In communities with several languages the term "lingua franca" arose, which made it possible to communicate across linguistic borders using the same language (Crystal, 2003, p.11). English as a Lingua Franca, often abbreviated to the acronym ELF, is according to Jenkins (2007) a contact language used among people who do not share a first language, and in this case the contact language is English. Although other languages have performed lingua franca roles throughout history, such as Latin in the Roman Empire, English was the first to be labelled. The English language spread internationally, and gradually became a frequent language used in international affairs such as conferences and meetings (p.2). According to Crystal (2003) the idea of the need for a world lingua franca started in the 1950s. Since 1945, many international organizations were made, for instance the United Nations, the World Bank and the World Health Organization (p.12). Today, people are more mobile than in 1950. People can communicate through the Internet with others across the globe, and travelling across the globe is also much easier due to air transportation. "And never has there been a more urgent need for a global language" (Crystal, 2003, p. 14).

#### 2.5.3 English in Europe

Anderman & Rogers (2005) points to the fact that English in Europe has traditionally been viewed as a foreign rather than a second language (p.12). This has however changed in recent

years - an increasing number of Europeans say that they feel confident using English (Ibid.). English has become the lingua franca of Europe. When Europeans struggle to understand each other, they speak English. It is likely that they will communicate in English despite of having similar mother tongue languages, such as the Scandinavian languages. Norwegian, Swedish and Danish are not foreign languages, but actually neighbouring languages. An article published in Aftenposten<sup>3</sup> in May 2016 with the title "Norwegians and Danes share something nice: bad English" (own translation) is about the increasing use of English between Norwegians and Danes as they fail to understand each other, despite of having mother tongues based on the same one (Hegtun, 2016). Hegtun writes that "Something has happened in the latest generation. The most frequent explanations are of the banal and obvious kind. Globalization. The Internet" (own translation) (Ibid.). Instead of trying to understand each other, Danish, Swedish and Norwegian people play if safe, and speak English.

In addition to changing the tradition for language use in Europe, English also affects translation. A study has shown that English words and expressions have influenced Swedish translations, and as well on the level of sentence constructions and rhetorical devices (Anderman & Rogers, 2005, p.13). English has become the lingua franca in Europe, and is also beginning to leave traces in Norwegian in the form of loan words, for one thing. Translation and subtitling from English to Norwegian might lead to anglicisms, as has been the case in Swedish translations.

In their study, Johansson & Graedler (2005) examine the presence of English loan words in Norwegian, by no means a new phenomenon – but with an increasing spread into everyday discourse and new domains (p.185). They present that 3,4% of the words in the 'Norwegian bokmålsordbok' derive from English, and estimate that 80-90 % of all recent loan words deriving from a foreign language after WWII come from English (Ibid.). The amount of loan words spotted in Norwegian running text is not as vast as one might think, but the impact is more evident in films and TV. "English programmes, which are becoming increasingly numerous on Norwegian TV channels, now form part of everyday life for most Norwegians" (Johansson & Graedler, 2005, p.193). Norway has long tradition of importing films with English speech, and because TV and films are added subtitles and not dubbed, Norwegians have numerous opportunities to listen to the English language while reading Norwegian subtitles (p.193).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Aftenposten – the most read newspaper in Norway, with approximately 1 million online readers daily.

### 2.6 A report on subtitling for Norwegian television

Blystad & Maasoes (2004) quantitative research on Norwegian subtitling aims to calculate the volume of Norwegian subtitling on five of the most watched TV channels. The study is based on media statistics, and presents a quantitative content analysis of Norwegian TV channels' time slots and viewer ratings to chart the scope of the subtitling. The report also compares the assumed amount of subtitling to other types of written text Norwegians read, such as newspapers and books. The report includes an extract of a book by Sylfest Lomheim, stating that textual input from subtitles is massive, and that it is surprising that subtitles gain so little attention in Norway today.

The report introduces the concept of invisibility in subtitles. Blystad & Maasoe (2004) say that in a way, a subtitler should aim to type 'invisible subtitles', because subtitles are often first noticed when they have mistakes or other errors. This way, good subtitles 'pass unnoticed' by the audience. Subtitling in Norway is invisible also from a political and cultural point of view, according to Blystad & Maasoe (2004, p.1). The amount of viewers that depend on subtitles due to hearing impairments have affected the way subtitles are viewed, and there are no requirements to work as a subtitler in Norway.

The difference between NRK and the other TV channels is highlighted in the report. NRK has long tradition for allocating significant resources towards subtitling, and has an internal subtitling department, in addition to a proofreading section. NRK has an in-house subtitling department consisting of 40-45 well-qualified freelancers that work full-time, whom are paid well, compared to other subtitlers in the trade. **------ utvid litt** 

The report concludes that the consumption of written text through television is extremely high in Norway (Blystad & Maaseide, 2004, p.22). They say that it is reasonable to assume that reading subtitles on TV is among the most important sources of written text, and that it demographically reaches a broader range of the population than books and the Internet. Norwegians are exposed to an average of 33 minutes of interlingual subtitles daily, a textual volume equivalent to 17-18 novels through the course of a year.

#### 2.7 The future of subtitling

Blystad & Maaseide (2004) stress that the field of subtitling is pressured by an increasing focus on making subtitling more efficient in terms of time and money. Subtitlers today have to work quickly to earn a decent wage, and the focus on efficiency has led to an increase in the use of second language translation and machine translation. They state that we need to

ensure good quality of Norwegian subtitles, because of the subtitles' scope; the amount of readers (p.23).

Two crucial elements are introduced as factors for good subtitling. Firstly, the subtitlers must fully master the Norwegian language. Secondly, the subtitlers need enough time to create good textual products. Children and young adults are particularly exposed to poor subtitling, as analyses of their preferred TV programmes show that they consume subtitling on the TV channels that has the poorest subtitling quality, due to a high amount of second language subtitling and machine translation techniques (p.23).

Crystal (2003) expresses one possibility of English's future role.

In 500 years' time, will it be the case that everyone will automatically be introduced to English as soon as they are born (or, by then, very likely, as soon as they are conceived)? If this is part of a rich multilingual experience for our future newborns, this can only be a good thing. If it is by then the only language left to be learned, it will have been the greatest intellectual disaster that the planet has ever known (Crystal, 2003, p.191).

The world's languages are in constant change. Languages change over time, for several reasons. Globalization has had a role in softening the border between languages, and it is apparent that the global language English has come to stay. However, language politics can partly control the use of English in the Norwegian language. Colloquial speech between people on the streets is untameable, but written language used in books, newspapers, TV programmes and films can be controlled to a higher degree. The big future question is to what extent Norwegian policy makers are in retaining or developing the Norwegian language.

## **3 Methods**

In this thesis I decided to conduct qualitative research, by using in-depth interviews. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013) the main benefit of interviews is that they can give privileged access to a person's thoughts and opinions about a particular subject (p.169). I considered interviews to be the most fruitful method when studying the informants and their perceptions on their working situation, and especially their views on the situation of English in Norway and how this impacts on subtitling. As this study uses qualitative methods, it cannot be used to generalize, but it can show tendencies in the subtitling field in Norway today. The interviews were semi-structured in-depth interviews, opening up for the possibility of asking follow-up questions to extract as much interesting information as possible. The interviews were conducted using an interview guide, in which contained questions about the subtitler, working conditions before and now and on linguistic premises. The interviews were conducted via telephone and Skype, according to the informants' wishes, recorded on a voice recorder and later on transcribed to secure reliability.

#### **3.1** The research project

In my research I conducted five semi-structured in-depth interviews using an interview guide. To ensure accuracy in the interviews I used a voice recorder to record the informants, and transcribed the interviews shortly after. It was very important for me to ensure that the voice recorder worked properly. Also, it was important to use a voice recorder of good quality to secure high-quality audio files that it would be effortless to transcribe from.

The interviews were conducted in Norwegian due to both me and the informants' native language being Norwegian. I could have conducted the interviews in English; all my informants are skilled in English. However, I decided to interview in Norwegian because some of the questions were somewhat personal. For instance, they were asked to describe the worst part of working as a subtitler. I think their professional roles would have appeared to a larger extent if we spoke in English, while I wanted them to present their personal and honest views. To be able to use the interviews in the analysis, I first transcribed the interviews in Norwegian, and later on translated them.

#### 3.1.1 The selection of informants

The selection of informants was first done by actively contacting two subtitlers. Through mail correspondent with one of them, he suggested to post a short note on my behalf on a web based platform for Norwegian translators; NAViO. This way, subtitlers with experience translating English-Norwegian volunteered to be part of the study. Because of the study's scope I decided to carry out interviews with no more than five subtitlers, resulting in interviewing three subtitlers working for NRK (Norsk Rikskringkasting) and two working for commercial companies. This was however not intentional, as I did not think before-hand that the differences between these groups would be noteworthy. In hindsight, I am very glad that I interviewed subtitlers both working for NRK and private sector. Three of the informants were women and two were men, and their subtitling experience varied from 10 to 20 years. All the subtitlers worked as freelancers, but the subtitlers in NRK are hired by them as a stable employer.

#### 3.1.2 Interview guide

The interview guide consisted of 16 questions with three main sections, 1) the subtitler, 2) working conditions before and now and 3) linguistic context. The interviews were estimated to last from 30-45 minutes. The interview guide and time estimation was e-mailed to the informants prior to the interviews, to make them able to prepare their thoughts. The interviews started with factual background questions, to make a natural link over to more challenging questions and to 'warm up' the informants. The aim of the interview guide was to make sure to ask the most important questions related to the study's research focus and to ensure to talk about the same themes with the different informants. The interview guide was not always strictly followed, opening up for a conversation rather than an examination of the informants. It was important for me to ensure a comfortable conversation setting with the informants to make them talk open and freely.

#### 3.1.3 Semi-structured in-depth interview

In-depth interviews are used when you want to study the world from the informants' point of view; their opinions, attitudes and experiences (Tjora, 2010, p. 90). Because this project aims to present subtitlers' opinions on their own working situation including their thoughts on English in Norway, I evaluated that the qualitative interview would be the best way to gather information. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013) the main benefit of interviews is that they can give privileged access to a person's thoughts and opinions about a particular subject (p. 169). About semi-structured interviews they state that the balance of power tends to shift

away from the researcher, and towards the informant in these situations. This allows a coconstruction of knowledge, and can lead to a feeling of an empowering role for the informants (p. 173). As mentioned, I wanted the informants to talk as freely as possible, and therefore gave them the opportunity to steer the interviews to some degree. Many interesting findings appeared when the informants' talked freely and were not controlled by the questions. I gave the informants the opportunity to talk about a subject until several of them said "Where were we? What was the question, again?" These 'digressions' led to interesting information. I was careful to remind the informants on the question and topic if they talked themselves very far away from the subject.

The language used in an interview situation is very essential. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013), a crucial decision to make prior to interviews is to decide which language to use, especially if there are several languages to choose between (p. 177). They continue saying that informants should wherever possible be allowed to express themselves in the language in which they feel most comfortable. An interview is a social process between two or more people, and language is vital to ensure correct communication. The informants in this study were all Norwegian native speakers, and therefore I conducted the interviews in Norwegian. None of the informants uttered a wish to go through with the interviews in another language than Norwegian. As mentioned, Norwegian might not be a self-evident language to use in this setting, as the informants are proficient in English, in addition to the thesis written in English. I assumed that the informants would prefer to speak in Norwegian, as this being their native languages might be the most comfortable.

## 3.2 Gathering and processing data material

#### 3.2.1 Gathering data material

To gather the data material I used a Roland voice recorder, securing high quality of the audio files. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013), it is generally agreed that for interviews to be really useful they need to be recorded. Taking notes presents a problem of fidelity because it does not allow the capture of nuanced responses and disrupts the interviewing process (p.186). Recording the interviews, I could focus on the conversation with the informants, and not on other technicalities. During a 30-45 minute interview, a lot of information is given, and recording the conversation ensures the content. Using a voice recorder can be very useful, as long as one uses it correctly. Being the only source of data material until the recordings are transcribed, it is vital that the recorder works. One should also think about the quality of the

recording, to secure a clear dialogue that makes the transcription process straightforward and exact. Saldanha and O'Brien stress that it is crucial to try the equipment at the beginning of the interview to make sure the recordings are appropriately labelled and have back-ups (Ibid).

Shortly after the interviews were finished, I transcribed the interviews. To secure the anonymity of the informants I transcribed using bokmål<sup>4</sup> to avoid any dialectical characteristics that could be used to identify the informants. I also avoided using names and cities in the transcriptions, and instead typed \*name\* or \*city\* if the informants gave such information.

#### **3.2.1.1 Telephone interview**

Two of the interviews were conducted over telephone. Initially I suggested interviews using Skype,<sup>5</sup> but two of the informants preferred doing the interview by telephone. There are positive and negative sides of every interview method, but in spite of the interviews lasting for 30-45 minutes, which is not recommended over the phone, the telephone interviews felt successful. Saldanha and O'Brien (2013) stress that semi-structured interviews are more difficult than structured interviews using telephone, because the interviewer lacks the non-verbal feedback, and certain complex questions can be more difficult to answer over the phone (p. 186). I did not perceive this as a problem during the two telephone interviews.

#### **3.2.1.2 Interviews using Internet**

Three of the interviews were conducted using Skype. That way, I could interview the informants in other cities, but still being able to hear and see them. Saldanha & O'Brien state that an online medium can facilitate for a participation of people hard to reach otherwise, such as people living abroad or busy professionals, and it also keeps costs down (p. 187). If I were to conduct all five interviews face-to-face, I would have to use a lot of time and money travelling. Also, subtitlers are professionals who are skilled using technology, and it is reasonable to think that interviewing the subtitlers through the Internet when they are in their professional setting can be fruitful. I perceived the Skype interviews as successful.

#### **3.2.2 Processing data material**

The five interviews were conducted in the course of two weeks. Collecting data is a continuous process of analysis and interpretation, according to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013), which can lead to changes in the research design, for instance the interview schedule (p. 185).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Bokmål is the most widespread written language in Norwegian, being one out of two official forms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Skype is a video chat and voice call application on the Internet.

They continue saying that when the researcher him-or herself both conducts and transcribes the interviews, they are immersed by the process of data elicitation from the beginning, which can help to develop a feeling of the data, which may result in ideas on how to best organize and code the data further in the analysis (p. 186). The process of conducting interviews and transcribing them increased my feeling of ownership towards my material, which helped and motivated me when analyzing the data. The massive data material was not as frightening to start analyzing, due to the feeling of ownership towards the material from the very beginning.

The method I used to analyze the transcribed data material was content analysis. I coded the transcriptions, extracting words that struck me as especially interesting and words and expressions that showed certain patterns throughout the five interviews, and put the codes into a table. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013), coding involves

identifying units of analysis, i.e. segments of text which contain one piece of information that is relevant to answering the research question, and then applying labels, for example in order to group broadly similar statements, or identify features that may need closer attention. These labels should help the researcher retrieve and group the units of analysis in such a way that patterns are highlighted (p. 189).

After having coded the transcriptions, I got an overview of the material in an additional document much shorter than the transcribed material, to assist me in the further analysis. I started to analyze the informants' statements one interview question at a time, both using the transcriptions and codes to see patterns and themes.

## **3.3 Research quality**

#### 3.3.1 Validity

Validity deals with whether the research is trustworthy, and that the data material can be used as a source for answering one's research question. Validity has three possible sources of threats; the researcher, how the research is conducted and the informants. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013), no researcher is free from theory or ideology, and this inevitable consequence of the nature of social research cannot be seen as a threat to validity (p. 30). The subjectivity of the researcher will always be part of qualitative research, and it is important to keep this in mind. I used my former knowledge on the field of subtitling when creating interview questions, which includes for instance theories from a course on translation studies. Saldanha and O'Brien (2013) present the matter of 'researcher unintentional expectancy effect', which may lead to informants answering what they believe the researcher wants to hear, because the researcher unknowingly asks leading questions (p.30). The questions I asked were open and non-leading, trying to limit possible prejudice. The research was conducted using a voice recorder, securing accuracy in the informants' statements. Considering the informants in the research, they were recruited by what Saldanha and O'Brien describes as 'purposive sampling', which entails selecting informants based on predefined critical parameters. In corpus-based studies and interview-based studies, this technique is commonly used (2013, p.34). I needed to interview subtitlers with enough work experience to be able to describe whether the working situation in subtilling has changed, and I needed subtitlers who translated from English to Norwegian. Due to this, I purposively collected my informants using these criteria. I assess the validity of my research as satisfactory.

#### 3.3.2 Reliability

Reliability deals with awareness of possible sources of error in the research, and whether one would get the same results if repeating the research at another time. According to Saldanha and O'Brien (2013) the researcher should demonstrate that the data collection and analysis methods are dependable, that the methods are transparent and that the results consequently can be concluded as credible. If the researcher fails to discuss how he or she collected data and analyzed the material, the researcher removes the possibility for other researchers to replicate the research results. If that is the case, the results cannot be tested, and credibility is undermined (p. 35). To ensure reliability in my research I used the same interview guide with all five informants. Through recording and precisely transcribing the data material, I have avoided misquotes, which increases the reliability of the research.

#### 3.3.3 Potential for generalization

Most qualitative research is limited in scope, and my research is limited to five informants. There is no foundation for generalizing on behalf of this study's results. However, the results in my study can probably be transferred to similar studies on subtitlers, and therefore this study is useful. I compare my research to previous research on translators to support my results, but there exists very little literature on subtitlers, as the better part of existing literature focuses solely on the subtitling process. This is a situation that hopefully will change in the near future.

## 4 Analysis and discussion

In this chapter I will present and discuss the result of the interviews. I have chosen to analyze based on topic, and will therefore present my informants views in three main subsections, the subtitler, working conditions before and now and linguistic premises. I will present a summary of the different answers and chosen quotes, comment on these findings and then interpret and discuss them using relevant theory. The interview questions are presented in in italic.

## 4.1 The subtitler

In the beginning of each interview, all five informants were asked to present their gender, language background, education and years of experience in the subtitling business, to paint a picture of the selection of participants in the study. I have chosen to present this data in a table to create an overview of the informants.

Informant	Gender	Age	Languages	Education	Experience
A	Female	59	English – Norwegian Swedish – Norwegian	Intermediate subject (1.5 yrs) in linguistics and theoretical translation theory	10 years
В	Female	43	English – Norwegian Swedish – Norwegian Danish – Norwegian	Bachelor's degree in English and Scandinavian language and literature.	14 years
С	Female	47	English – Norwegian Swedish – Norwegian	Intermediate subject in English and education in translator of specialist literature.	20 years
D	Male	44	English – Norwegian Russian – Norwegian German – Norwegian Swedish – Norwegian Danish – Norwegian	Main subject in Russian and intermediate subject in German.	15 years
E	Male	40	English – Norwegian German – Norwegian Norwegian – English	Cand. mag in linguistics, almost Cand.philol.	14 years

## 4.1.1 The informants

Table 1

The table above has a category on work experience. These numbers tell how long the different informants have been working with subtitles. Many of them have had various jobs within the field of translation. The work experience and translation experience includes teaching, interpreting in court rooms, translating medical and juridical documents, translating books and novels, journalism work and dubbing scripts.

Informant A has worked as a subtitler for 10 ½ years. She works in the private sector. She entered the trade when she was 49, having worked in various other fields; in retailing, in a travelling agency, as secretary, in finance and a lawyer office. She has worked in many sectors, and took higher education as an adult. When she first entered the translation trade, she started with dubbing scripts. After that she has had many translation jobs, within books, medicine and law. Within subtitles she has worked with food programmes and documentaries, and various other programmes.

Informant B has worked as a subtitler for 14 years. She entered the trade as an unknowingly strike-breaker in the early 2000s. She worked for a commercial company from 2002-2009, and was hired by NRK in 2010. She wanted to quit the trade in 2009 because of poor working conditions, but was contacted by NRK and started working for them, doing subtitling work and translation. Earlier she has worked with translating commercials and copy edited language in books. She has also worked within news. Today she mostly translates documentaries and news, and is slowly pulling out of the subtitling trade to work in journalism, to increase communication and contact with other people.

Informant C has worked as a subtitler for 20 years. She knew that she wanted to be a subtitler from young age, and studied to become a translator. She has worked with subtitles from 1995, with a 6 month gap in 2001 when she worked in an alarm installation company because there was crisis in the subtitling trade. She has also translated books, travel guides and books in popular science, while working in subtitling. She entered the trade working for the private sector, and has experience from almost every subtitling company in Norway. Today she works in NRK.

Informant D has worked as a subtitler for 15 years. He works in private sector. When he graduated, he first worked as an interpreter in Russian, travelling around and interpreting in court rooms. He has worked in teaching, interpreting, with written translation and subtitling. Gradually he worked more and more with subtitling, and today he is a subtitler on a full time basis, mostly translating from English. He is content with his situation in private sector, and translates several popular TV shows on Norwegian television. Informant E has worked as a subtitler for 14 years. In addition to working with subtitles, he has translated factual prose simultaneously. He started to work in the private sector in 2002, and now works for NRK. His work in NRK entails subtitling from documentaries and historical films in one end to children programmes in the other. When he started working in 2002 he was often given first language translations in Swedish, and had to translate that to Norwegian. Because the language was familiar to Norwegian, the pay was reduced. In NRK, all the subtitled material is first language translation, which he enjoys very much due to his bilingual background and special interest in linguistics.

#### 4.1.2 The subtitlers' working day and perceptions of their working situation

After a few background information questions had been asked, the informants were asked to describe their work day. "*How would you describe your average workday*?" All five of the informants answered that the best part of working with subtitling was the flexibility, independence and freedom. They described a work day with freedom to decide when and where to work. Informant C said that "The best part is the freedom. The flexibility". The informants stated that a flexible work day was an important reason for deciding to work with subtitling in the first place.

The informants described a profession characterized by loneliness and the lack of colleagues. Informant A said that "It is a lonely profession. Most subtitlers work from home, like I do now". Informant B and C also mentioned the lack of colleagues, and that the colleagues they have contact with is through Facebook and mail-groups, and seminars a few times a year. Informant C said that "Now that I don't work in a commercial bureau anymore, I think the worst part of working as a subtitler is not having colleagues to cooperate with on a daily basis". While four of the informants work from home, informant E rents an office with other translators, and described why having an office is recommendable. "It is simply to get out of the house. A place to leave the work, both mentally and physically. When I'm finished, I go home". Informant C rents an office one a week, to get in contact with other translators and eat lunch and socialize with colleagues. They all describe the social part of subtitling as a challenge, but are more or less content with their situation despite of working alone. Informant A said that people who are very depending on social input would probably not start working as a subtitler, and that subtitlers often are people that enjoy working alone.

The informants had different views of what the worst part of the profession is. Informant C said that "The worst part of working for the commercial bureaus is the insane time pressure to be able to earn a decent salary. The worst part in NRK is the lack of colleagues". Informant A said that the worst part of the job was the lack of support from the employer, and informant B stated that the worst part is the loneliness, which is why she is gradually pulling out of the trade. Informant E said that the worst part is not being permanently employed. "There isn't one subtitler in Norway that is permanently employed. The whole bunch work as freelancers and are self-employed, and job security is a non-subject". Informant D, for the most part content with his working situation, said that the only complaint is the non-existing wage development. He stated that the fees in subtitling has not increased as in other sectors.

#### 4.2 Conditions before and now

#### 4.2.1 Working conditions in the past

Two informants said something about the working conditions in the past. Informant B, who has worked as a subtitler for 14 years, mentions some interesting facts. She used to work in private sector but is now working for NRK, and describes the way some commercial bureaus treated their workers "We could not take time off back then. We had to work, work and work and still feel that it didn't pay off". She was not allowed to put her name after the subtitles, and found that very peculiar. She did however accept this, partly because the subtitles she produced were made with the draft method where the subtitles were translated to Swedish, machine translated to Norwegian and then she came in and corrected the machine translation. She entered the trade when living abroad during the early 2000s, and discovered after a few months that she was an unknowingly and involuntary strike-breaker. When she got in contact with the Norwegian trade she found out that she had been hired because the subtitles in Norway had boycotted that company because of poor working conditions. She said after telling this "So I guess that says a lot about the trade. You were hired if you had a Norwegian grandmother... They had absolutely no focus on quality".

Informant C, who has 20 years of subtitling experience, also worked in private sector before entering NRK. She mentions a crisis in the subtitling trade in 2001. She states that at that time, almost no one found jobs in subtitling. Because of this she worked with something different for six months, before re-entering the subtitling trade. When she started working as a subtitler in 1995, there was a decline in the trade. She went to Bergen to find work, before moving to Sweden to work for an associated Oslo-company. She recalls very good working conditions at that time. The pay was ok, and there was wage increase for rush projects. She says that her interest and drive in subtitles motivated her to work, and she worked a lot. When she returned to Norway, subtitlers were forced to start one man enterprises and thereby became self-employed. She does not explain why they were forced to do this. Being self-employed they had to take more of the risk themselves, while payment stood still. Despite of being forced to become self-employed, she thinks the trade is much more cynical today. Earlier, it would be beneficial to work a lot because it gave disbursements. She says that after 2000, the subtitling trade in private sector has become less interesting, due to machine translation programmes. She recalls that the salary in private sector used to be higher, and that today it is very stressful to earn a decent wage in private sector.

#### 4.2.2 Working conditions today

"*Could you describe the working conditions in your profession today?*" When this question was asked, five aspects of the subtitling profession appeared; the differences between private and public sector, the poor dialogue between worker and employer, salary and time pressure.

#### 4.2.2.1 NRK versus private sector

The first aspect that came up was the vast difference between working as a subtitler for NRK<sup>6</sup> and for private sector. Subtitlers in NRK work freelance similar to those in private sector, but are secured a stable work and good salary due to their hiring in NRK. Subtitlers working for the commercial bureaus are not nearly as fortunate. Informant A said that "You can say that the working conditions today, towards the subtitle companies, are genuinely not good. NRK is one great exception, they have very good conditions". Informant E emphasized that the differences are vast between NRK and private sector, considering important factors for working conditions such as economy, time pressure and job security. The pay in NRK is much higher, the time pressure is not as evident and they are secured enough translation projects in NRK to earn a good salary.

Informant B said that as she works freelance for NRK, it is a challenge to distribute money for holiday pay, insurance and pension insurance. However, she states that she earns enough to take a day off at times. The subtitlers are well paid for their subtitle projects in NRK, and she states that it is a good solution that gives subtitlers the ability to use more time on each project, ensuring good quality of the subtitles. After the subtitles are done, they are proofread by a special proofreading section in NRK.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> NRK – Norsk Rikskringkasting. A state owned broadcast company that broadcast TV, radio and new media.

#### 4.2.2.2 The relationship between worker and employer

Informant A, who works freelance for a commercial bureau, describes the working conditions as very poor. She describes a working situation where the fees have not increased in at least ten years, and that there exists no sympathy from the employer if you are having issues with the job or project. "If you don't like the job, just quit, we have hundreds of people waiting in line!" is her opinion on the company's attitude. She also said that there is little or no dialogue between worker and employer, but that if you really need help with something, it is not utterly impossible to contact the company for help.

Informant B started working as a freelance subtitler ignorant of knowing she entered a company where the Norwegian subtitlers were going on strike. She, living abroad at that time, was not informed by her employer that others were striking, probably due to them being desperate for subtitlers. This shows that the employer lacked respect towards their employee. When she wanted to leave the business in 2009 because of poor working conditions, she felt that the company she was working for had a 'divide and rule' method, where they removed the possibility for their subtitlers to communicate and help each other through the use of an intranet. The people in charge for handing out projects to the subtitlers had less and less personal attachment with their employees. She felt during that period that the company wanted to reduce the links between both employers, employees and the management, and that a very important feeling of belonging was taken away. "When you work independently you are in a way dependant of having a good relationship with people and a feeling of belonging, but they took this feeling of belonging away. And I think they used that as a method for controlling us, both considering salary, fees and rights" she said.

#### 4.2.2.3 Salary and fees

Salary in the subtitle business is a topic that all the informants had an opinion about. Informant E said that "The wage developments in private sector are non-existent. It has been at a stand-still for 15 years and more. The real income standards have been uniquely negative". Informant B said that NRK follows a wage index that counts for all governmental negotiations, where they get a small increase in August every year. She describes the rest of the business as a different story, where it seems like the salary is going down. "I think the last time they increased the fees in [company name] was in 2004 and after what I've heard the fees have decreased since then" she said. She continued saying that "I think working in this line of business is tough. You want to do a best possible job, but have a professional pride you are not allowed to use, because there's only focus on profit". Informant D has worked

freelance for the same commercial bureau for 20 years, and is content with his salary. He has however noticed that few subtitlers in the private sector have been as fortunate.

I have had one employer which has been good considering salary, and I have worked a lot and think I have earned a decent salary. But of course, the wage developments have not been ideal. Especially those working for large, international bureaus, they are pressured on both time and salary and quality, on all fronts really.

Informant C said that she believes the commercial subtitling bureaus are cutting the workers' wages with the sole intention of saving money. She states that the fees have been standing still for a very long time, and that there is hardly any increase of salary if you work during inconvenient hours. Informant A, working freelance for a company, said that the fees have been standing still for a long time. Helped by NAViO they were able to increase the fees a little, two or three years ago. "I feel like I can live well on my salary if I work seven hours a day. However, I can certainly not work only five hours, that would result in a very painful arm having to work very fast" she said.

#### 4.2.2.4 Time pressure

Informant C states that when machine translation entered the field around year 2000, the work in subtitles became more stressful and less interesting. Before machine translation appeared, she did a lot of translation from English to Norwegian, from source language to target language. She described that as both fun and well paid, but after the technology paved way for machine translation to do some of the work, it became more and more stressful to work with subtitles, because they were increasingly given Norwegian semi-translated machine translations. Their role of subtitlers was to fix and correct the machine translation. These projects implied little pay and much stress.

Informant E states that deadlines have become shorter and shorter as time has passed, also in NRK. "Everything has become more immediate. Ideally programs shall be translated at once and broadcasted quickly. Therefore the average deadline in NRK has also decreased, but we still operate with deadlines that those in private sector think are wildly long and luxurious". While informant B, working for NRK, says that she can take a day off, informant A says that her average work day has to be at least seven hours long, and that she always brings her work on vacation. "Because we are self-employed we don't have vacations in the same way as other people do. I always bring my work on vacations, and I have heard many other subtilers say the same thing" she said.

#### 4.2.3 Technical tools' influence on the subtitler's work day

*"What tools do subtitlers use today when subbing TV and film?"* All five informants point to two important tools – the Internet, and a special computer program for subtitles, such as EZ Titles and Global Titling System (GTS). The internet revolutionized the subtitle profession. Informant C said that "When I started working with subtitles we had to look up words and call people all the time. Now we simply use the Internet".

"In what way has technology changed your work day?" Informant D said that "It is a lot easier to figure things out than before. In the old days we used dictionaries and went to the library, and we knocked about a lot and spent a lot of time on that". Informant C states that the entry of the Internet made an enormous improvement for the profession, and that the computer programs designed for subtitles made it a lot easier to do a good job in shorter time.

Technical tools and the Internet have changed the way subtitlers spend their time. Instead of using a lot of time travelling around and calling experts, they can now focus more on the subtitles themselves, with the technical tools as a solid framework. Informant E says technology has made the work easier, but that it has led to an expectation of more rapid working speed. This might explain why subtitling for private sector in particular entails high time pressure to the individual, which again leads to poorer subtitle quality.

According to Informant E, technology has changed the working day for subtitlers. Before the entry of the Internet, subtitlers' work day was far more manual and timeconsuming than today. The subtitler had an original manuscript and a recording tape, and prepared subtitles by hand using paper, a pencil and a stop watch, making sure the subtitles would appear on screen long enough. Subtitlers wrote the subtitles on a paper reel using a 4mm typewriter. When the TV-programme or film was broadcast, the paper reel was put into a device with a camera which focused on one text line at a time, and then faded the text onto the main broadcast image. The subtitler used a button to control the progress on the paper reel, a time-consuming method where mistakes could easily happen.

The further development within computer technology made the paper reel superfluous. The subtitles were eventually written on a computer, and then generated as an analogue video image. This new method, similar to the former, implied that the text had to be super imposed on the screen. Eventually digital video tapes were invented, which opened up for digitally super imposing the text before the picture was converted to analogue broadcasting. With the entry of the videotape came electronic editing programmes. At that time, it became possible for subtitlers to time code the subtitles, which replaced the need for manually controlling the order and pace. Subtitlers still prepared subtitles by hand, before typing the subtitles on a computer and manually time coding the subtitles to the videotape.

Eventually the system for time coding digitalized, and around year 2000 the subtitlers could watch a time coded videotape on VHS<sup>7</sup> and deliver finished subtitle files on a floppy disk. The transition to digital videotapes did not have a great impact until the cost of computers and technical equipment sank. Because computers were extremely expensive, subtitlers still worked with VHS-copies. After a while video files replaced the videotapes and home computers became more powerful, in which removed the need for expensive VCRs<sup>8</sup> and special equipment for time coding.

When computer technology finally revolutionized in the 21<sup>st</sup> century, so did the subtitling profession. The technological tools used by subtitlers today consist of a lap-top with Internet access. They watch the TV-programme or film on the lap-top, type the subtitles using a special programme developed for subtitling and add the subtitles to the video file. The work process of subtitling audiovisual material is a lot less time-consuming today.

## 4.3 Norwegian and English – the linguistic context

#### **4.3.1** Translating from English

"Is it different to translate from English than other languages?" When asked this question, all of the informants said that in all translation situations the main challenge is the target language. They said that it is time consuming and challenging to find good, Norwegian alternatives, and that their focus is to write best possible Norwegian subtitles. Informant C said that "In English all the words and expressions are considerably different, but there are construction traps where you become a bit influenced by the English language constructions". When translating from other languages, for instance Swedish, there are other challenges such as resemblance traps; similar expressions in the Scandinavian languages that have different meanings, informant B mentions.

Informant D said that he thinks it is an important task for subtitlers to write good Norwegian – to teach the viewers Norwegian. Informant B points to the idea that subtitles are language learning, Norwegian language learning, to the viewers. Three out of five informants said that their role as subtitlers should not imply taking leading roles in the Norwegian language development. Because of this they are very careful using loan words from English in their subtitles. They are aware that their subtitles are shown to a great deal of viewers, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> VHS – Video Home System.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> VCR – Videocassette Recorder.

both the subtitlers in NRK and in private sector try to be conservative in their language use, to avoid becoming a language force that influences many viewers using anglicisms.

According to informant B, she believes that anglicism blend into the Norwegian language more and more due to globalization, and that this becomes visible in subtitles as well as the language in general. She thinks that this development is more visible in subtitles done by commercial companies than in NRK, because of inexperienced subtitlers that produce subtitles that are not controlled or proofread before they are broadcasted. Informant E, who also works in NRK, confirms that they are not allowed to use loan words from English in their subtitles, and that their role as subtitlers do not involve having leading roles in the language development.

Informant D and A, both working as freelancers for private sector, points to the matter of linguistic liberty, and state that subtitles are constrained by Norwegians' knowledge of English. Informant D, who also translates from Russian and German, says that he has less freedom in his translations in English. Because Norwegians have a good understanding of English, he states, you cannot derive far from the original in the subtitles. He has in mind that the viewers understand the English language, and that the subtitles have to follow the dialogue to a large extent. He says that if he were to translate a Russian programme, he would be freer to write the subtitles differently. He says that

I have learned that if you are subtitling English, or even Danish and Swedish, there should be a strong correlation between what is said on the screen and what you read from the subtitles. If the dialogue is a bit weird, you should translate it just as weird, to not confuse the viewers.

Informant A says that she has in mind that the viewers probably understand some English, and that because of the condensing or reduction that is needed in subtitles, words such as 'yes', 'no' and the characters' names for instance, are removed. She says that "It rarely becomes a colourful and fantastic language; you just have to retain the essence of it". Informant E points to why he thinks subtitles are constrained by Norwegians' knowledge of English, and says that it becomes extra challenging for subtitlers because the viewers use the subtitles as a support, rather than the sole source for understanding.

#### 4.3.2 Opinions on Norwegians' language skills before and now

"How do you perceive Norwegians' proficiency in English today compared to earlier?" The informants stated that they have to separate between the obvious differences between the post war-generation and younger people. They said that subtitles are very important to ensure meaning for those who do not know English, but also that subtitles assist people who know

English with a faster understanding. Informant C said that "I think people are more used to deal with English today, but that many people think they are better than they really are. I think that people maybe are more critical to the Norwegian subtitles they read on screen". Informant B says that she thinks Norwegians have improved in English, but that we still need subtitles to fully comprehend the content. Informant D states that "People are very alert. We notice that people are more enlightened and that through Internet and downloading of movies and because of fans and such people have become more aware of the subtitles and language".

Informant E points to what he thinks is a critical border in Norwegian's language skills in English; cable TV. He recounts that the children who grew up with cable TV, and thereby access to English speaking material from an early age, achieved an almost passive bilingual vocabulary. He says that this development made it more challenging for subtitlers than earlier, because it brought along a higher expectation from the subtitles. The subtitles developed from the sole channel securing linguistic content to becoming a support reading. This eventually led to subtitlers having to be more careful with their translations; the subtitles should not deviate too much from the original. He further said that he felt freer in earlier years, because today he is aware that most of the viewers know the source language. Informant A said that during the last 4-5 years she has probably used more and more English words in the Norwegian subtitles because it is so commonly used in society in general. Informant B said that she translates differently today because she is more aware of the different groups one translates for, and informant C admits that she uses certain loan words because they are so incorporated in the Norwegian language, but that she tries to avoid it to preserve the Norwegian language in the best possible way.

#### 4.3.4 The role of English in Norway

"Do you think the role of English in Norwegian has changed in the period you have worked with subtitles?" Informant E, who earlier stated that he believed cable-TV had an important role in the language development from the 1980s, does not see any quantum jumps in the last 15 years. He does however describe the entry of English TV channels in Norway as a quantum jump, because he believes it had a huge influence on children and their increasing use of loan words.

Informant B said that she absolutely thinks we have opened up for letting English into the Norwegian language, through global slang-words such as "wtf" and "lol", which are untranslatable. She believes this has happened due to slackening language politics and globalization. Informant D believes the role of English in Norway has changed in the period he has worked with subtitles, because of the entry of computers and the Internet. He says that English absolutely has a larger role today and probably has influenced his subtitles in form of more loan words, as earlier mentioned. He says that the big question is to what degree the subtitles should influence the language development, and that he tries to hold back and not be part of the leading changes in Norwegian language.

### 4.3.5 The future of Norwegian subtitling

"How do you think Norwegian subtitles from English will develop in the future?" Several hypothetical aspects came up when this question was asked; poorer subtitles in the future due to machine translation and the massive focus on money, a declining quality of the Norwegian language and additional loan words. Also, the informants mentioned a need for a process of increasing awareness of subtitles, because it can be a great aid to advance and facilitate language learning.

Machine translation is regarded a possible threat for the language by the informants. Informant E said that he fears a downhill slope in subtitle quality, and that the only flagship left to maintain the Norwegian language is NRK, which only uses first language translation from source language to target language. He views the increasing use of machine translation without human touch as a problem. "Machine translation tools will make things easier, but it is something about the human touch as well. There is a reason why machines can't reproduce human language; it is a code form that is difficult to treat mechanically". Informant C is worried about the use of machine translation. She believes that it shrinks the linguistic variation, due to its statistical nature. She fears that machine translation will lead to a more standardized and worsened Norwegian language. Translators and subtitlers are at the time much better at writing vivid and varied language than machines, she states.

The amount of money spent on subtitlers is a factor that the informants mention. Informant B says that "Today it is carte blanche in the commercial sector, which means that companies make a lot of money, but still pay their subtitlers buttons and scraps". She further suggests that if the commercial companies had skipped some steps, they could pay their subtitlers better. That would however require a regulated system similar to NRKs, where people handed out subtitling projects to freelancers. Informant E says that the use of money is an important step towards better subtitles. "The focus is solely on money. Except maybe in NRK. We try hinting to certain commercial channels, sending screenshots of horrible translations, saying that 'we wish you spent some money on this as well'".

While the informants fear that the future will be more difficult for subtitlers both considering economy and more machine translation, they have certain ideas on how this can be avoided. One idea is consciousness-raising. Informant B says that she thinks directors' attention towards the quality of the subtitles has to be raised, because the subtitles are part of making their products good or bad. "Subtitles are a supplement to the film, and the film is ruined if the subtitles are bad" she says. She further says that subtitling and subtitlers needs more attention in the business beyond that, into society in general.

Informant A said that "Subtitles facilitate language learning", and informant B that "A lot of people learn Norwegian through subtitles, especially foreigners and children, and I think it is sad that such an important learning area is neglected". She continues saying that there are many more people in Norway today that watches TV than who reads books, and thereby subtitles are language learning on a high educational level. Informant C point out the potential learning outcome of good subtitles. She says that incredibly many people read subtitles, and especially young people and foreigners use it as a tool to learn Norwegian. She points out that these groups normally do not read much other literary material, and thereby the subtitles become even more important.

Despite of some informants fearing a bleak future for the Norwegian language, the informants say that they hope language politics will put subtitles on the agenda. Informant D imagines a bright future if subtitlers are willing to keep up with technology and be flexible. Informant C says that a lot of exciting things are on the language agenda, and that the Norwegian people and politicians are making active political choices towards our language future, for instance using more English in educational settings. She says that when she was studying 20 years ago, there was much talk about the fear of a more anglicized language, but that after working as a subtitler for two decades it is not as dramatic as people have feared, and that she does not think it will develop in a turbo effect in the future either.

### **4.4 Discussion**

In this section I present what I consider the most important and interesting findings from the research, comparing and discussing them to relevant theory. The study aims among other things at providing insight into how Norwegian subtitlers perceive the task of translating audiovisual material from English to Norwegian, and sets out to answer the research question: "How do Norwegian subtitlers perceive their own working situation before and now, and what are their thoughts, more specifically, on past and current English influence on Norwegian subtitles, society and citizens?"

Four main findings appeared from the research. Firstly, working conditions in subtitling today show signs of worsening; a decline in salary, a higher time pressure and changes due to technology's entry in subtitling. In addition, increasing differences in working conditions between NRK and private sector begins to show. Secondly, there is an increasing use of English in Norway, yet still Norwegians overestimate own abilities in English. Thirdly, the subtitlers feel constrained by the Norwegian audiences' English understanding, leading to the thought of subtitles as vulnerable translation. Lastly, the potential learning outcome and scope of subtitling show signs of being ignored in favour of profit.

### 4.4.1 The development of subtitlers' working conditions

The informants agreed that their working conditions, both the physical and linguistic dimension, are affected by certain factors, such as salary, time pressure and an increasing use of technology today.

Two of the informants recounted a change in fees in the 2000s. In 1995, working as a subtitler implied a reasonable salary with wage increase for rush projects. The informants explained that in the beginning of the 2000s they were forced to start one man enterprises, which led to more personal economical risks. They expressed a feeling that subtitling companies from then onwords solely focused on ways to save money. According to all five informants, the fees in private sector have barely increased since 2001. Blystad & Maasoe (2004) support these claims, stating that the field of subtitling is pressured by an increasing focus on making subtitling more efficient (p.23). The informants also presented not insignificant wage differences between subtitlers working for NRK and private sector. Blystad & Maasoe (2004) confirms that the fees in NRK are much higher than in the commercial companies; NRK having tradition for allocating significant resources towards subtitling (p.11). They state that NRK pays its subtitlers well, and that it is reasonable to state

that NRK is the broadcaster that pays the most for translation work. Other subtitling agencies refused to confirm their subtitling rates (p.7). Blystad and Maasoe confirm that according to translators, the low fees paid by the television channels impacts the quality of the work, and that the prices charged by agencies is to some degree dictated by the television channels (2004, p.9).

The informants also pointed to an insane time pressure working in private sector. They said that because subtitlers in commercial companies are paid poorly per project, they need to work fast to earn a decent wage. In addition, the deadlines in private sector are much shorter than in NRK. Folaron (2010) stresses that today's accelerated work pace and expectations cannot be underestimated when assessing translators' working conditions (p.430). Blystad and Maasoe (2004) confirms that competition between subtitling companies places high demands on the efficiency of the translators, and that demands for efficiency and competitive pricing dominate the work day for agencies and translators (p.3).

The informants said that new technology and technological tools led to changes in their working day and working conditions. They stated that the Internet and the lap-top computer revolutionized their working situations, in terms of what they spent their time on. Subtitling became less manual work, and also more mobile. Because of the developments of machine translations and an increase in second language translation, their work day changed. The informants generally had a positive view on the entry of technology in their field of work, but saw it as a double-edged sword, as it might lead to a decrease in subtitle quality. Folaron (2010) states that in less than thirty years, technology has radically transformed the procedures of professional translators. The adoption of personal desktop computers in the mid-1980s was a turning point in translators' work process (p.429). It can be argued that because the commercial companies use more second language translation and machine translation than NRK, this leads to subtitles with more errors and poorer quality (Blystad & Maasoe, 2004, p.9).

#### 4.4.2 The use of English in Norway

The informants said that they noticed an increasing use of English in Norwegians' colloquial speech, and especially in children and teenagers. They stated that they noticed more and more English words and expressions in Norwegian speech, for instance acronyms like "LOL", "WTF" and "YOLO". One informant stated that he believed this increasing development of using English words might be due to easy access to English TV channels in Norway. Concerning translation, studies have shown that English has influenced Swedish translations,

in form of words, expressions, sentence constructions and rhetorical devices (Anderman & Rogers, 2005, p.13). A similar Norwegian study was conducted by Johansson & Graedler in 2005, examining the use of English loan words in Norwegian. They stated that English increasingly spreads into everyday discourse, and estimated that 80-90 % of foreign loan words in Norway after WWII derived from English. They stressed that TV and film were important sources for English language input to Norwegians (p.185). Crystal (2003) states that translation has played a central role in communication between people for thousands of years, and statistics have showed that approximately a quarter of the world's population is fluent or competent in English (Crystal, 2003, p.11).

Anderman & Rogers (2005) confirm that an increasing number of Europeans say that they feel confident using English (p.12). This is relatable to the informants concern towards Norwegians' confidence; that Norwegians are less skilled in English than they state. The informants consider Norwegians today as averagely skilled in English, yet increasingly accustomed to deal with English on a daily basis. This can be related to a study in St.mld 23 (2007-2008), which proved that Norwegian pupils' perceptions of own English skills did not correspond with their test results, and that pupils in upper secondary school failed to exceed a medium level, especially regarding writing skills (p.58). In another study however, Norwegian pupils got the best test scores in English compared to eight other nations, particularly doing well in reading comprehension and oral skills (p.57). The most successful pupils estimated that 50% of their English skills had been acquired off school hours (Ibid.). Blystad and Maasoe (2004) state that subtitling is one of the largest sources of written text to Norwegians, possibly equivalent to 17-18 novels in the course of a year. Because Norway has long traditions for subtitling, the consumption of written text through television is extremely high (p.22). These studies indicate that Norwegian children and youths have a high degree of reading comprehension and oral skills in English, which can be argued to be beneficial when encountering subtitles. Possibly, Norway's long traditions of subtitling might be one of the reasons why Norwegian pupils are good at reading and speaking English.

### 4.4.3 Subtitling as vulnerable translation

The informants presented a new and prominent challenge in their working situation; Norwegians' degree of oral understanding towards English. The informants stated that they assumed that the better part of the viewers had certain knowledge of English. Because of this, they became less free in producing their subtitles. Two informants pointed to the matter of linguistic liberty, and stated that their subtitles were constrained by Norwegians' knowledge of English, a situation that would never occur if translating from Russian or German, for instance. The informants stressed that subtitling from English led to subtitles with a strong correlation to what is said on the screen. All the informants stated that they believed that Norwegians had improved in English during the last decades, but that they still depend on subtitles to fully comprehend the audiovisual content. Norwegians' English skills today have resulted in a more challenging situation for subtitlers, they continued, bringing along a higher expectation from the subtitles. One informant stated that he felt much more free constructing subtitles in former years. According to Munday (2008), subtitling can be defined as vulnerable translation. Subtitles are constrained by time and space, but can also be constrained by the audience. If readers of subtitles have knowledge of the source language, they may be more observant and critical towards the subtitles. They might have expectations regarding their idea of the quality, and this can lead to additional pressure for the subtitler. Greenall (2011) says that a surprisingly common assumption in discussions about translation and subtitling seems to be that the audience has no knowledge of the source language, and hence is completely at the mercy of the translator or subtitler. She stresses that a large part of the audience often are fairly fluent in English; and thereby able to understand much of the verbal material (p.58). The informants stated that Norwegians are more critical to what they read today than before due to their improvement in English, and that this has led to subtitles becoming constrained by not merely time and space, but also the Norwegian audience.

### 4.4.4 The future of Norwegian subtitling

The informants expressed certain concerns and hopes concerning the future of Norwegian subtitling from English. The informants said that private sector's focus on saving money and not paying their subtitlers enough to do a proper job became evident in the subtitles. Two informants worried that the increasing use of machine translation would result in a standardized and worsened Norwegian language; a downhill slope in subtitle quality. Blystad & Maasoe (2004) stress that the field of subtitling is pressured by the increasing focus on economical factors. They also say that it is reasonable to assume that reading subtitles on TV is among the most important sources of written text to Norwegians, and that it demographically reaches a broader range of the population than books and the Internet (p.22).

The informants agreed on a wish for the future – raising awareness towards subtitlers and subtitles. Cintas & Remael (2007) say that directors should wake up to the reality that the translation process is an artistic factor, and needs more controlling to ensure good quality. This implies an increasing use of money towards subtitles (Cintas & Remael, 2007, p.38).

Some of the informants suggested that it might help to raise directors' attention towards subtitles and their influence on audiovisual material, and that subtitling should be on the political agenda because of its great scope and source for language learning. They stressed that politicians should stop neglecting subtitling and their invisible producers, and start demanding higher quality.

### **5** Conclusion

This thesis aims to explore how Norwegian subtitlers perceive their own working situation, whether their work situation has changed over the years and especially how they think the English language's role in Norway may have influenced their subtitles then and now. To answer these questions, a qualitative method was used. The method consisted of interviewing five Norwegian subtitlers using semi-structured in-depth interviews, and analysing their answers.

To conclude on the study's discoveries, there are four main findings. The first main finding is that Norwegian subtitlers' working conditions seem to be worsening in private sector, in terms of job security, salary and time pressure. The difference in working conditions between NRK and the commercial companies appear to be growing, which might result in subtitles with different quality, in addition to a class gap between subtitlers as a group. The second main finding is that the use of English loan words and expressions are increasing in Norway. Children and youths use more English words in their everyday lives. Despite of overstating own skills in English, studies have shown that Norwegian pupils score well in tests on oral communication and reading comprehension, which can be related to subtitles' role in potential language learning and development. The third main finding is that Norwegian subtitles from English can be defined as vulnerable translation, because the subtitles are constrained by the Norwegian audiences' knowledge. Norwegians are increasingly used to deal with English, and this influences how subtitlers produce subtitles. The fourth main finding is how Norwegian subtitlers think English has and is influencing Norwegian subtitling, and the future of subtitling. Several ideas came up towards how awareness can be raised; to improve working conditions and potentially subtitle quality in the future.

When it comes to the field of translation studies, this project contributes to the field as it aims to present the development of subtitlers' working conditions, and how this may have lead to changes in subtitle quality. There are no requirements for working as a subtitler in Norway today, and despite of subtitles and audiovisual translation gaining more ground in academic circles, there is still not much research on subtitlers as a group. As mentioned earlier, previous research tends to focus on the technical process of subtitling, and not the subtitlers thoughts on their work, profession and language awareness. In future research it might be interesting to study Norwegian subtitles; for instance by comparing subtitles on NRK and other TV channels. This study presents findings that technology and economy has led to an increasing use of machine translation and second language translation. What can the long term effects be from this? Machine translation and second language translation is increasingly used in subtitling in private sector, and it would be interesting to see an analysis on Norwegian subtitles on various TV channels. This is a fascinating avenue for research. Another potential future research might be to conduct a quantitative study on Norwegian subtitlers. This study presents five subtitlers' working conditions, which can show tendencies and probably be transferred to similar studies on subtitlers. However, conducting a wide-ranging quantitative study on several Norwegian subtitlers and their work might help raising more awareness towards the individuals and towards the field of subtitling and translation in general.

## Literature

- Anderman, G. & Rogers, M. (2005). English in Europe: for Better, for Worse? I G.M. Anderman & M.Rogers (Eds.), *In and Out of English : For Better, for Worse*. Clevedon, GBR: Multilingual Matters. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10110167
- Blystad, E.S. & Maasoe, A. (2004). *The invisible text. A report on subtitling for Norwegian television.* Oslo: University of Oslo. Retrieved from http://www.navio.no/documents?id=65420
- Cintas, J. & Remael, A. (2007). *Audiovisual translation: Subtitling*. Manchester: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Cronin, M. (2010). Globalization and translation. I Y. Gambier & L.V Doorslaer (Eds.), *Handbook of Translation Studies – volume 1* (p.134-139). Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10540418
- Crystal, D. (2003). English as a global language (2<sup>nd</sup> ed.). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Retrieved from http://ebooks.cambridge.org/ebook.jsf?bid=CBO9780511486999
- Díaz-Cintas, J. (2003). Audiovisual translation in the third millennium. I G. Anderman & M. Rogers (Eds.), *Translation Today Trends and Perspectives* (p. 192-204). Clevedon: Multilingual matters.
- Díaz-Cintas, J. (Ed.). (2008). *The didactics of audiovisual translation*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10250386
- Díaz-Cintas, J. (2013). Subtitling. I C. Millán & F. Bartrina (Eds.), *The Routledge Handbook* of *Translation Studies* (p. 45-59). London: Routledge.
- Folaron, D. (2010). Translation tools. . I Y. Gambier & L.V Doorslaer (Eds.), Handbook of Translation Studies – volume 1 (p.429-436). Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10540418
- Forcada, M.L. (2010). Machine translation today. . I Y. Gambier & L.V Doorslaer (Eds.), Handbook of Translation Studies – volume 1 (p.215-222). Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10540418
- Gambier, Y. (2013). The position of audiovisual translation studies. I C. Millán & F. Bartrina (Eds.), *The Routledge Handbook of Translation Studies* (p. 45-59). London: Routledge.
- Gottlieb, H. (1998). Subtitling. I M. Baker (Ed.), *Routledge Encyclopedia of Translation Studies* (p. 244-248). London: Routledge.

- Greenall, A.K. (2011). The non-translation of swearing in subtitling: Loss of social implicature? I Serban, A., Matamala, A., & Lavaur, J. (Eds.). (2011). Audiovisual Translation in Close-up : Practical and Theoretical Approaches. (p.45-60). Berne, IN, USA: Peter Lang AG. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10589267
- Hegtun, H. (2016, 28.04.). Nordmenn og dansker har noe fint sammen: dårlig engelsk. *Aftenposten*. Retrieved from http://www.aftenposten.no/amagasinet/Nordmenn-ogdansker-har-noe-fint-sammen-Darlig-engelsk-8448792.html
- Jenkins, J. (2007). *English as a lingua franca: attitude and identity*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Johansson, S. & Graedler, A. (2005). Anglicisms in Norwegian: When and Where? I G.M. Anderman & M.Rogers (Eds.), *In and Out of English : For Better, for Worse*.(p.185-201). Clevedon, GBR: Multilingual Matters. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10110167
- Katan, D. (2011). Occupation or profession, a survey of the translators' world. I R. Sela-Sheffy & M. Shlesinger (Eds.), *Identity and Status in the Translation Professions* (p.65-87). Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10505826
- Munday, J. (2008). *Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications*. Florence, KY, USA: Routledge. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/detail.action?docID=10370235
- Remael, A. (2010). Audiovisual translation. I Y. Gambier & L.V. Doorslaer (Eds.), *Handbook* of *Translation Studies – volume 1* (p. 12-17). Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10540418
- Saldanha, G. & O'Brien, S. (2013). *Research methodologies in translation studies*. New York: Routledge.
- Sela-Sheffy, R. (2005). How to be a (recognized) translator. Rethinking habitus, norms, and the field of translation. *Target*, 17(1), 1-26. DOI: ISSN0924-1884/E-ISSN1569-9986 John Benjamins Publishing Company. Retrieved from http://www.tau.ac.il/~rakefet/papers/RS-Target-habitus.pdf
- St. meld. Nr 23 (2007-2008). Språk bygger broer. Språkstimulering og språkopplæring for barn, unge og vaksne. Retrieved from https://www.regjeringen.no/no/dokumenter/stmeld-nr-23-2007-2008/id512449/?ch=1&q=
- Tjora, A. (2010). Kvalitative forskningsmetoder i praksis. Oslo: Gyldendal Akademisk.
- Venuti, L. (2002). *The Scandals of Translation*. London, US: Routledge. Retrieved from http://site.ebrary.com/lib/ntnu/reader.action?docID=10054799#

# Appendix A: interview guide

# 1. Hvem er teksteren

- Utdanning
- Språkbakgrunn
- Arbeidserfaring/biografi
- Hva er din språkbakgrunn?
  - Språk i porteføljen, hvordan språkene ble lært, hvor lang tid.
- Hvilke språk oversetter du fra og til?
- Har du høyere utdanning ved høyskole/universitet?
  - Hvilke fag og grad.
- Har du arbeidet med noe annet enn å tekste film/tv-serier? Hva?
- Hvor lenge har du arbeidet som tekster av film/tv-serier?
- Hvordan vil du beskrive livet som tekster?
  - Hva liker du ved å arbeide som tekster, det beste/verste med yrket, hvordan er arbeidshverdagen, alene eller sammen med andre?

# 2. Forutsetninger før og nå

- Arbeidsforhold (lønn, tid, kontrakter, policys etc.)
- Teknologi
- Språk i forhold til engelsk, kan bedre nå enn før
- Kan du beskrive arbeidsforholdene som tekster i dag?
  - Lønn, tid, kontrakter etc. Har disse endres med tiden?
- Hvilke hjelpemidler brukes i dag når man tekster film?
- Teknologiske hjelpemidler hvordan har de endret teksterens hverdag?

# 3. Språklige forutsetninger

- Er det annerledes å oversette fra engelsk enn andre språk?
- Hvordan oppfatter du nordmenns språkferdigheter i dag vs. før?
  - Spesifiser gjerne tidsmessig.
- Tror du disse endringene har påvirket hvordan du tekster?
- Tror du rollen til engelsk har endret seg i den perioden som er relevant for deg?
- Hvis du tekster andre språk enn fra engelsk, eller annerledes engelsk nå enn før, hva betyr dette rent konkret?

# 4. Avsluttende spørsmål

• Hvordan ser du for deg at teksting av Engelskspråklig materiale vil utvikle seg i Norge fremover?

### **Appendix B: the study's relevance to the teaching profession**

This master's thesis was written as part of the 5-year programme for teacher education at NTNU. I would say that the findings of the study can be implemented in my future work with children and young people. Technology has brought with it innumerable possibilities for language learning. Traditionally, language has been learned in class rooms by reading, writing, listening and speaking. These four aspects are vital in language learning. However, children and youths today achieve English skills also outside of school. As presented in this thesis, studies have shown that the best-skilled pupils in English state that they have attained 50% of their English skills outside school.

As a future language teacher I think it is important to keep up with technology, and be open to new and different ways of implementing technology in language learning. Language is a living matter, and changes because of globalization and other factors. English has a very strong foothold in Norwegian language, society and citizens, and it is not uncommon to hear young Norwegians speaking Norwegian including many English words and expressions. As a future language teacher, I do not think this is a development we should restrain. Globalization has led to a closer connected world both physically and linguistically. English as a global language and lingua franca of Europe will probably continue to grow and develop. It is clearly important to retain the Norwegian language, yet still I do not perceive language changes as dramatic or negative, but a natural development in languages.

Subtitles are a large textual source for many young people. Children and youths spend quite a lot of time watching TV, playing computer games and using other audiovisual media. I think subtitles is a possible source for language learning in the classroom; it is short, easy accessible and interactive. In the language classroom, one could for instance let pupils find examples of 'good' and 'bad' subtitling, practice to make own subtitles, ask them what they think of subtitles and if they know any subtitlers, and if they could imagine becoming subtitlers themselves one day. I believe that the language classroom is a great arena for raising awareness towards subtitlers, subtitling, and the development of languages. Language and translation will be as important in the future as in the past, and I think introducing pupils and students to the field of subtitling from a very young age can help remove the invisibility stamp that tends to mark this field of research for the time being.